



Michael Shermer
Skeptiko #379

1
00:00:08,830 --> 00:00:05,710
today we welcome science historian

2
00:00:11,350 --> 00:00:08,840
best-selling author and one of the

3
00:00:13,930 --> 00:00:11,360
world's best-known skeptics dr. Michael

4
00:00:16,330 --> 00:00:13,940
Shermer our back to skeptic oh he's here

5
00:00:18,820 --> 00:00:16,340
to talk about his new book heavens on

6
00:00:22,240 --> 00:00:18,830
earth the scientific search for the

7
00:00:25,000 --> 00:00:22,250
afterlife immortality and utopia

8
00:00:27,910 --> 00:00:25,010
dr. Shermer it's always fun to talk to

9
00:00:31,229 --> 00:00:27,920
you you are one of my favorite skeptic

10
00:00:34,720 --> 00:00:31,239
frenemies and it's good to have you back

11
00:00:37,270 --> 00:00:34,730
right here in in a hotel room as you can

12
00:00:39,490 --> 00:00:37,280
see in beautiful San Francisco the

13
00:00:42,550 --> 00:00:39,500

lighting is really funky here you get a

14

00:00:46,630 --> 00:00:42,560

little a little warm glow on my face

15

00:00:50,230 --> 00:00:46,640

how's that that's great

16

00:00:51,910 --> 00:00:50,240

you know I was just thinking before as I

17

00:00:55,229 --> 00:00:51,920

was kind of doing the introduction and

18

00:00:58,479 --> 00:00:55,239

stuff like oh man I wonder if they'll be

19

00:01:02,610 --> 00:00:58,489

another Michael Shermer I mean I think

20

00:01:05,469 --> 00:01:02,620

you captured a certain time and you

21

00:01:08,680 --> 00:01:05,479

found your own lane and you found a

22

00:01:10,960 --> 00:01:08,690

voice I just wonder with you know things

23

00:01:11,560 --> 00:01:10,970

change I wonder if that will ever come

24

00:01:15,580 --> 00:01:11,570

again

25

00:01:18,880 --> 00:01:15,590

oh yeah sure there's lots of skeptics

26
00:01:21,190 --> 00:01:18,890
doing what I do you know I never wanted

27
00:01:23,110 --> 00:01:21,200
to be cult of personality for skeptic

28
00:01:25,600 --> 00:01:23,120
magazine and skeptic Society when I'm

29
00:01:28,180 --> 00:01:25,610
gone you know moving on to the great

30
00:01:31,719 --> 00:01:28,190
iCloud above where my connectome will

31
00:01:34,300 --> 00:01:31,729
live forever but my physical body's done

32
00:01:36,219 --> 00:01:34,310
the skeptic magazine will continue the

33
00:01:38,680 --> 00:01:36,229
skeptic Society will continue their you

34
00:01:42,039 --> 00:01:38,690
know there's you know plenty of funding

35
00:01:44,170 --> 00:01:42,049
for you know continuing the organization

36
00:01:47,020 --> 00:01:44,180
it's not based on me at all really I'm

37
00:01:48,730 --> 00:01:47,030
the currently driving force but and then

38
00:01:50,289 --> 00:01:48,740

in terms of my books you know I just try

39

00:01:52,090 --> 00:01:50,299

to do what you know write about what I'm

40

00:01:55,080 --> 00:01:52,100

interested in that I think is relatively

41

00:01:57,039 --> 00:01:55,090

important but there's certainly nothing

42

00:01:59,320 --> 00:01:57,049

special about that there's a lot of

43

00:02:00,910 --> 00:01:59,330

great science writers I was just at a

44

00:02:02,859 --> 00:02:00,920

book event last night with Leonard Malad

45

00:02:04,450 --> 00:02:02,869

now and you know he's one of the great

46

00:02:06,730 --> 00:02:04,460

science writer Steve Pinker is one of my

47

00:02:08,859 --> 00:02:06,740

good friends as the Sam Harris ensued a

48

00:02:11,409 --> 00:02:08,869

lot of people writing about science and

49

00:02:14,289 --> 00:02:11,419

reason and skepticism so I think it's a

50

00:02:15,940 --> 00:02:14,299

big movement now and in fact my latest

51
00:02:17,259 --> 00:02:15,950
column I just that just came out inside

52
00:02:19,959 --> 00:02:17,269
of you American is on the rise of

53
00:02:22,030 --> 00:02:19,969
atheism that there's a lot more atheist

54
00:02:23,530 --> 00:02:22,040
than not not just the rise of the nuns

55
00:02:26,979 --> 00:02:23,540
the people that tick the box for no

56
00:02:28,809 --> 00:02:26,989
religious affiliation but because those

57
00:02:30,429 --> 00:02:28,819
people may be going to be supporting

58
00:02:32,739 --> 00:02:30,439
Deepak Chopra or something you know just

59
00:02:33,940 --> 00:02:32,749
the you know the New Age movements or

60
00:02:36,640 --> 00:02:33,950
whatever not necessarily become an

61
00:02:40,390 --> 00:02:36,650
atheist but but I think a lot of them

62
00:02:43,479 --> 00:02:40,400
now are the rise of atheism you know we

63
00:02:46,449 --> 00:02:43,489

are a powerful voting bloc so I am just

64
00:02:48,549 --> 00:02:46,459
one voice among many along with yourself

65
00:02:50,619 --> 00:02:48,559
well that's no no I'm on the other side

66
00:02:54,159 --> 00:02:50,629
but you're a you're a humble guy I

67
00:02:56,530 --> 00:02:54,169
appreciate appreciate humility because I

68
00:02:58,659 --> 00:02:56,540
think you really have made more of an

69
00:02:59,890 --> 00:02:58,669
impact but that's great you know and I'm

70
00:03:01,839 --> 00:02:59,900
so glad you're here

71
00:03:04,689 --> 00:03:01,849
I talked with you a couple years ago

72
00:03:06,069 --> 00:03:04,699
about your book the moral arc a book

73
00:03:08,170 --> 00:03:06,079
that I really liked we had a good

74
00:03:11,080 --> 00:03:08,180
conversation on but this time around

75
00:03:14,739 --> 00:03:11,090
your latest book is kind of much closer

76
00:03:17,679 --> 00:03:14,749
to the skeptic Oh swing zone tell folks

77
00:03:23,799 --> 00:03:17,689
a little bit about what you set out to

78
00:03:25,299 --> 00:03:23,809
do with heavens on earth sort of a part

79
00:03:26,949 --> 00:03:25,309
of it as an extension of my previous

80
00:03:29,259 --> 00:03:26,959
book the moral arc I talked about

81
00:03:31,539 --> 00:03:29,269
utopias for example the attempts to

82
00:03:33,579 --> 00:03:31,549
create a heaven on earth and why that

83
00:03:35,979 --> 00:03:33,589
always fails but of course that's not

84
00:03:38,860 --> 00:03:35,989
what most people believe most people

85
00:03:41,640 --> 00:03:38,870
believe that that there's some place to

86
00:03:44,439 --> 00:03:41,650
go after the death of the body and brain

87
00:03:48,250 --> 00:03:44,449
that the mind or soul or you know some

88
00:03:50,439 --> 00:03:48,260

incorporeal ethereal essence that

89

00:03:53,049 --> 00:03:50,449

represents who we are moves on to some

90

00:03:55,679 --> 00:03:53,059

other place so I just decided to take a

91

00:03:57,729 --> 00:03:55,689

swing at you know looking at the

92

00:03:59,589 --> 00:03:57,739

scientific aspects of that you know to

93

00:04:01,329 --> 00:03:59,599

what extent is that true what is it that

94

00:04:02,739 --> 00:04:01,339

different religions claim and so right

95

00:04:05,860 --> 00:04:02,749

off the bat for example there's a

96

00:04:07,509 --> 00:04:05,870

history to heaven and this is not like

97

00:04:09,280 --> 00:04:07,519

seeing the history of cosmology where

98

00:04:11,589 --> 00:04:09,290

there's a sense of a growing yeah but I

99

00:04:13,989 --> 00:04:11,599

think heaven really takes us in another

100

00:04:15,969 --> 00:04:13,999

direction which is a direction that

101
00:04:18,880 --> 00:04:15,979
you've covered and covered well in terms

102
00:04:21,640 --> 00:04:18,890
of religion but you know I think what

103
00:04:23,290 --> 00:04:21,650
it's kind of a tricky word when you get

104
00:04:25,630 --> 00:04:23,300
into heaven I mean what I really wanted

105
00:04:26,090 --> 00:04:25,640
to focus on because like I say this has

106
00:04:28,130 --> 00:04:26,100
been

107
00:04:31,010 --> 00:04:28,140
topic of mine an interest of mine I've

108
00:04:32,440 --> 00:04:31,020
probably interviewed have a hundred

109
00:04:34,910 --> 00:04:32,450
interviews with some of the top

110
00:04:37,160 --> 00:04:34,920
consciousness researchers names that you

111
00:04:40,160 --> 00:04:37,170
would recognize near-death experience

112
00:04:42,740 --> 00:04:40,170
researchers and yeah sure

113
00:04:44,540 --> 00:04:42,750

I guess where we might start where I

114

00:04:47,030 --> 00:04:44,550

thought we might start because heavens

115

00:04:49,040 --> 00:04:47,040

on earth one of the areas you get into

116

00:04:51,230 --> 00:04:49,050

is near-death experience because I think

117

00:04:52,460 --> 00:04:51,240

when you look at science and you look at

118

00:04:54,890 --> 00:04:52,470

what's going on and what's made an

119

00:04:58,070 --> 00:04:54,900

impact in the culture certainly this

120

00:05:01,010 --> 00:04:58,080

idea of okay does this consciousness

121

00:05:03,050 --> 00:05:01,020

thing survive bodily death has been one

122

00:05:05,300 --> 00:05:03,060

place where we can kind of put our

123

00:05:10,070 --> 00:05:05,310

attention and really answer that

124

00:05:12,980 --> 00:05:10,080

question and I don't know we need to dig

125

00:05:15,830 --> 00:05:12,990

into that I don't know that you really

126
00:05:27,830 --> 00:05:15,840
did a very comprehensive job of looking

127
00:05:29,570 --> 00:05:27,840
at that research and thought about the

128
00:05:32,590 --> 00:05:29,580
topic you think you pretty well-versed

129
00:05:35,060 --> 00:05:32,600
yeah yeah yeah that reincarnation

130
00:05:38,000 --> 00:05:35,070
anomalous experiences and so on so the

131
00:05:40,100 --> 00:05:38,010
idea is that you know most of us are do

132
00:05:42,470 --> 00:05:40,110
list ik by nature so we have a feeling

133
00:05:43,970 --> 00:05:42,480
that there's something floating around

134
00:05:45,830 --> 00:05:43,980
up there beside you know that are

135
00:05:47,960 --> 00:05:45,840
thoughts that are not just our brain and

136
00:05:50,720 --> 00:05:47,970
chemicals and that and that essence that

137
00:05:52,640 --> 00:05:50,730
sense we have is what leads us to think

138
00:05:55,100 --> 00:05:52,650

that you know this floats off the brain

139

00:05:58,190 --> 00:05:55,110

and goes off into somewhere else so the

140

00:06:00,560 --> 00:05:58,200

near-death experience then is alleged to

141

00:06:03,560 --> 00:06:00,570

be an example or evidence of how this

142

00:06:05,390 --> 00:06:03,570

can happen and but of course we you know

143

00:06:08,810 --> 00:06:05,400

we start right up by pointing out that

144

00:06:09,560 --> 00:06:08,820

the people are not actually dead it's

145

00:06:13,070 --> 00:06:09,570

near death

146

00:06:15,050 --> 00:06:13,080

they're not dead they're there near

147

00:06:16,700 --> 00:06:15,060

death and that's very different that is

148

00:06:19,150 --> 00:06:16,710

your brain your consciousness is still

149

00:06:21,860 --> 00:06:19,160

going at some level even if you're

150

00:06:23,900 --> 00:06:21,870

unconscious at the moment there's still

151
00:06:26,150 --> 00:06:23,910
some part part of your brain operating

152
00:06:28,070 --> 00:06:26,160
that generates these experiences so I

153
00:06:33,080 --> 00:06:28,080
talked about whether it's a good topic

154
00:06:34,430 --> 00:06:33,090
to get into because that's well and and

155
00:06:35,990 --> 00:06:34,440
I want to go there because I think

156
00:06:37,640 --> 00:06:36,000
that's kind of misunderstood and

157
00:06:39,710 --> 00:06:37,650
misconstrued by a lot of people we have

158
00:06:42,110 --> 00:06:39,720
a whole bunch of neuroscience that says

159
00:06:45,860 --> 00:06:42,120
these are the conditions under which a

160
00:06:47,390 --> 00:06:45,870
brain is able to function in terms of

161
00:06:50,420 --> 00:06:47,400
memory in terms of conscious experience

162
00:06:52,310 --> 00:06:50,430
so this idea of Neth death versus

163
00:06:53,930 --> 00:06:52,320

near-death you know we'll get into that

164

00:06:56,330 --> 00:06:53,940

a minute certainly when someone is

165

00:06:59,000 --> 00:06:56,340

completely comatose from every measure

166

00:07:03,580 --> 00:06:59,010

we have we don't believe there's any

167

00:07:08,420 --> 00:07:06,320

talked about holed up on Evan because I

168

00:07:09,740 --> 00:07:08,430

want to talk about him later but the

169

00:07:11,210 --> 00:07:09,750

first thing I want to hit you with is

170

00:07:12,890 --> 00:07:11,220

just that the first thing I did when I

171

00:07:14,360 --> 00:07:12,900

got the books I went to the index and I

172

00:07:16,310 --> 00:07:14,370

said okay here are all the near-death

173

00:07:19,130 --> 00:07:16,320

experience researchers I've talked to

174

00:07:20,750 --> 00:07:19,140

are they in there no name after name

175

00:07:22,100 --> 00:07:20,760

after name none of them in their you

176

00:07:24,530 --> 00:07:22,110

know a couple years ago I interviewed

177

00:07:27,020 --> 00:07:24,540

Jan Holden from the University of North

178

00:07:29,000 --> 00:07:27,030

Texas who along with Bruce dr. bruce

179

00:07:30,290 --> 00:07:29,010

grayson from university of virginia two

180

00:07:31,670 --> 00:07:30,300

of the most prominent names in

181

00:07:33,890 --> 00:07:31,680

near-death experience research they

182

00:07:37,340 --> 00:07:33,900

compiled this book the handbook of

183

00:07:39,560 --> 00:07:37,350

near-death experiences mainly for people

184

00:07:41,570 --> 00:07:39,570

in the medical community so that when

185

00:07:43,580 --> 00:07:41,580

they encounter someone who comes up out

186

00:07:45,680 --> 00:07:43,590

of a cardiac arrest and said hey i had

187

00:07:48,530 --> 00:07:45,690

this incredible experience they can be

188

00:07:50,480 --> 00:07:48,540

at least familiar with what to tell them

189

00:07:54,400 --> 00:07:50,490

at the time they published this book

190

00:07:57,170 --> 00:07:54,410

michael in 2009 they had over a hundred

191

00:08:00,440 --> 00:07:57,180

peer-reviewed papers that they included

192

00:08:02,719 --> 00:08:00,450

in their book by now there's over 200

193

00:08:07,159 --> 00:08:02,729

peer-reviewed papers i think i see any

194

00:08:08,570 --> 00:08:07,169

of that in your book look yeah i don't

195

00:08:10,730 --> 00:08:08,580

have to cite everybody that's ever

196

00:08:15,770 --> 00:08:10,740

written on the subject but you know any

197

00:08:17,500 --> 00:08:15,780

of them you don't say Sam carne uh who

198

00:08:19,940 --> 00:08:17,510

else

199

00:08:23,270 --> 00:08:19,950

presented both of them but you have

200

00:08:26,600 --> 00:08:23,280

least cited them but anyway let's back

201
00:08:28,130 --> 00:08:26,610
up for a second and I have to say you

202
00:08:29,810 --> 00:08:28,140
know Evan Alexander I want to talk about

203
00:08:32,690 --> 00:08:29,820
him but technically he's not a

204
00:08:34,940 --> 00:08:32,700
near-death experience researcher he's a

205
00:08:37,070 --> 00:08:34,950
Harvard neurosurgeon that had a

206
00:08:39,950 --> 00:08:37,080
near-death experience great book about

207
00:08:42,140 --> 00:08:39,960
it right that's right but he knows a lot

208
00:08:43,940 --> 00:08:42,150
about it he knows as much as you do much

209
00:08:45,829 --> 00:08:43,950
as I do because he but he hasn't

210
00:08:48,290 --> 00:08:45,839
published peer-reviewed papers on

211
00:08:51,230 --> 00:08:48,300
looking at the science peer review paper

212
00:08:53,030 --> 00:08:51,240
thing is a that's a red herring I'm not

213
00:08:55,610 --> 00:08:53,040

denying that people have really

214

00:08:59,180 --> 00:08:55,620

variances you're you're treating this as

215

00:09:01,730 --> 00:08:59,190

if the experiences represent some other

216

00:09:03,759 --> 00:09:01,740

dimension I haven't a place to go and

217

00:09:06,470 --> 00:09:03,769

that is not at all what these

218

00:09:08,720 --> 00:09:06,480

peer-reviewed papers indicate all's they

219

00:09:11,300 --> 00:09:08,730

say is that the people that have the

220

00:09:13,249 --> 00:09:11,310

experiences have very real experiences

221

00:09:16,370 --> 00:09:13,259

which I agree the experiences these

222

00:09:19,189 --> 00:09:16,380

people have are very real question is do

223

00:09:22,189 --> 00:09:19,199

they represent just neural activity or

224

00:09:24,559 --> 00:09:22,199

neural activity and something else and I

225

00:09:26,210 --> 00:09:24,569

claim that none of the research I've

226

00:09:29,930 --> 00:09:26,220

read none of the stories that of the

227

00:09:32,090 --> 00:09:29,940

papers are evidence of an afterlife you

228

00:09:35,090 --> 00:09:32,100

do claim that and and Michael look

229

00:09:36,949 --> 00:09:35,100

you're a science guy and you love

230

00:09:39,199 --> 00:09:36,959

science you're poured on science and you

231

00:09:40,910 --> 00:09:39,209

do a good job and the other thing you do

232

00:09:43,699 --> 00:09:40,920

a good job on and it's been one of your

233

00:09:47,120 --> 00:09:43,709

strong points with Christian apologist

234

00:09:49,519 --> 00:09:47,130

is you've called them on cherry-picking

235

00:09:51,559 --> 00:09:49,529

right say taking bible scripture and

236

00:09:54,920 --> 00:09:51,569

cherry picking out pieces that they want

237

00:09:57,379 --> 00:09:54,930

in order to make their point I gotta say

238

00:09:59,540 --> 00:09:57,389

I think that's what you've done here

239

00:10:02,059 --> 00:09:59,550

with the near-death experience research

240

00:10:05,120 --> 00:10:02,069

and I'd give you just one example you

241

00:10:06,980 --> 00:10:05,130

saw your medical historian you're not a

242

00:10:09,350 --> 00:10:06,990

medical doctor right you don't claim to

243

00:10:11,059 --> 00:10:09,360

be a medical doctor about a medical

244

00:10:17,480 --> 00:10:11,069

historian I'm just historian of science

245

00:10:19,280 --> 00:10:17,490

so what you think not neural activity

246

00:10:22,220 --> 00:10:19,290

that produces a powerful experience

247

00:10:25,850 --> 00:10:22,230

people can get that from my Alaska from

248

00:10:27,350 --> 00:10:25,860

ecstasy from deep meditation and so on

249

00:10:29,059 --> 00:10:27,360

we know this you can get it from brain

250

00:10:32,480 --> 00:10:29,069

stimulation you get it from oxygen

251
00:10:34,939 --> 00:10:32,490
deprivation I mean you think you seem to

252
00:10:37,670 --> 00:10:34,949
think it's something beyond that well

253
00:10:39,889 --> 00:10:37,680
here's where I would focus on is on the

254
00:10:43,009 --> 00:10:39,899
research on the science

255
00:10:44,840 --> 00:10:43,019
I don't think peer review is a red

256
00:10:47,960 --> 00:10:44,850
herring per se I think when you look

257
00:10:50,720 --> 00:10:47,970
it's the best means we have right now in

258
00:10:55,610 --> 00:10:50,730
science for policing science finding out

259
00:10:58,519 --> 00:10:55,620
if people are doing good work I'll get

260
00:11:00,740 --> 00:10:58,529
to that okay so I'd say you're not a

261
00:11:03,829 --> 00:11:00,750
doctor so when we get into medical

262
00:11:05,660 --> 00:11:03,839
fields I like to look at doctors

263
00:11:06,730 --> 00:11:05,670

I like the near-death experience

264

00:11:10,389 --> 00:11:06,740

research from

265

00:11:12,639 --> 00:11:10,399

Jeff long radiation oncologist right so

266

00:11:15,250 --> 00:11:12,649

this is a guy who works with death and

267

00:11:17,310 --> 00:11:15,260

dying patients all the time he also

268

00:11:20,530 --> 00:11:17,320

happens to be a near-death experience

269

00:11:23,800 --> 00:11:20,540

researcher compiled the largest database

270

00:11:26,170 --> 00:11:23,810

of near-death experiences analyzed it

271

00:11:30,130 --> 00:11:26,180

scientifically with the scientific

272

00:11:33,250 --> 00:11:30,140

survey and here's what he says I'll pull

273

00:11:36,850 --> 00:11:33,260

that up for you right now so I guess the

274

00:11:39,130 --> 00:11:36,860

question is for the average person who's

275

00:11:41,820 --> 00:11:39,140

trying to sort through this idea of

276
00:11:44,110 --> 00:11:41,830
near-death experience science research

277
00:11:47,440 --> 00:11:44,120
how do they sort through it how do they

278
00:11:50,710 --> 00:11:47,450
know what research really holds up out

279
00:11:53,350 --> 00:11:50,720
there the key thing is to know a few of

280
00:11:55,570 --> 00:11:53,360
the consistently seen elements of

281
00:11:57,940 --> 00:11:55,580
near-death experience that are the

282
00:12:00,160 --> 00:11:57,950
strongest evidence for their reality for

283
00:12:02,440 --> 00:12:00,170
example when you're under general

284
00:12:05,230 --> 00:12:02,450
anesthesia it should be impossible to

285
00:12:07,660 --> 00:12:05,240
have a lucid organized remembrance at

286
00:12:09,790 --> 00:12:07,670
that time in fact under anesthesia

287
00:12:11,620 --> 00:12:09,800
you're typically so far under with

288
00:12:12,910 --> 00:12:11,630

general anesthesia they often have to

289

00:12:14,949 --> 00:12:12,920

breathe for you I mean you're literally

290

00:12:18,250 --> 00:12:14,959

brain shut down to the level of the

291

00:12:20,230 --> 00:12:18,260

brainstem and at that point in time some

292

00:12:21,819 --> 00:12:20,240

people have a cardiac arrest their heart

293

00:12:22,630 --> 00:12:21,829

stops and of course that's very well

294

00:12:24,819 --> 00:12:22,640

documented

295

00:12:27,430 --> 00:12:24,829

they monitor people very carefully that

296

00:12:29,110 --> 00:12:27,440

are having general anesthesia so I have

297

00:12:31,389 --> 00:12:29,120

dozens and dozens of near-death

298

00:12:33,880 --> 00:12:31,399

experiences that occurred under general

299

00:12:36,730 --> 00:12:33,890

anesthesia and at this time it should be

300

00:12:38,949 --> 00:12:36,740

if you will doubly impossible to have a

301
00:12:41,139 --> 00:12:38,959
conscious remembrance and yet they do

302
00:12:43,780 --> 00:12:41,149
have near-death experiences at this time

303
00:12:45,970 --> 00:12:43,790
and their typical near-death experiences

304
00:12:47,290 --> 00:12:45,980
they have the same elements and appear

305
00:12:49,240 --> 00:12:47,300
to have them in the same order as

306
00:12:51,730 --> 00:12:49,250
near-death experiences occurring under

307
00:12:54,100 --> 00:12:51,740
all other circumstances and in fact a

308
00:12:55,750 --> 00:12:54,110
critical survey question I asked was

309
00:12:57,760 --> 00:12:55,760
what their level of consciousness and

310
00:13:00,250 --> 00:12:57,770
alertness during the experience was well

311
00:13:02,410 --> 00:13:00,260
even under general anesthetics under

312
00:13:04,389 --> 00:13:02,420
those powerful chemicals to produce

313
00:13:06,190 --> 00:13:04,399

sedation if they had a near-death

314

00:13:08,170 --> 00:13:06,200

experience under general anesthesia

315

00:13:10,480 --> 00:13:08,180

their level of consciousness and

316

00:13:12,250 --> 00:13:10,490

alertness was identical to near-death

317

00:13:14,920 --> 00:13:12,260

experience is occurring under all other

318

00:13:17,380 --> 00:13:14,930

circumstances there's absolutely no way

319

00:13:20,020 --> 00:13:17,390

the skeptics can explain that away it's

320

00:13:23,020 --> 00:13:20,030

impossible well we have a skeptic

321

00:13:25,480 --> 00:13:23,030

you're explaining it away he's wrong not

322

00:13:27,220 --> 00:13:25,490

every single one he's wrong let's make

323

00:13:29,980 --> 00:13:27,230

sure we understand he is a medical

324

00:13:32,350 --> 00:13:29,990

doctor he is a full-time radiation

325

00:13:36,010 --> 00:13:32,360

oncologist he works with people who are

326

00:13:38,080 --> 00:13:36,020

under anesthesia every day but it is

327

00:13:39,790 --> 00:13:38,090

wrong tell me tell me how you are tell

328

00:13:41,530 --> 00:13:39,800

me how your expertise would lead you to

329

00:13:44,470 --> 00:13:41,540

believe that he's wrong about his

330

00:13:48,190 --> 00:13:44,480

medical understanding of the state of

331

00:13:50,440 --> 00:13:48,200

consciousness a small percentage of the

332

00:13:53,050 --> 00:13:50,450

population wind under general anesthesia

333

00:13:55,090 --> 00:13:53,060

they become aware of what's going on

334

00:13:57,760 --> 00:13:55,100

it's well known well-known I've

335

00:14:00,160 --> 00:13:57,770

interviewed in anesthesiologist more

336

00:14:02,740 --> 00:14:00,170

than one on this show so there you go

337

00:14:05,590 --> 00:14:02,750

that's it so not that does not explain

338

00:14:08,380 --> 00:14:05,600

it's a well-known phenomenon that that

339

00:14:09,280 --> 00:14:08,390

they work around Alex you seem to be

340

00:14:11,980 --> 00:14:09,290

missing my point

341

00:14:14,350 --> 00:14:11,990

it isn't denying that people have

342

00:14:17,070 --> 00:14:14,360

powerful neural experiences under

343

00:14:20,950 --> 00:14:17,080

different conditions oxygen deprivation

344

00:14:24,150 --> 00:14:20,960

sleep deprivation they have these

345

00:14:26,980 --> 00:14:24,160

floating out-of-body experiences in the

346

00:14:29,310 --> 00:14:26,990

James winterice research with the pilots

347

00:14:32,230 --> 00:14:29,320

that are accelerated in centrifuges

348

00:14:34,570 --> 00:14:32,240

stimulating a part of the temporal lobe

349

00:14:36,040 --> 00:14:34,580

during these epileptic great you're

350

00:14:36,490 --> 00:14:36,050

really making my points here so you're

351
00:14:40,410 --> 00:14:36,500
right

352
00:14:43,150 --> 00:14:40,420
that you can even replicate all of the

353
00:14:46,240 --> 00:14:43,160
experiences that people report in NDEs

354
00:14:48,250 --> 00:14:46,250
through drugs through conditions through

355
00:14:49,990 --> 00:14:48,260
neural stimulation not true but you're

356
00:14:53,700 --> 00:14:50,000
still making you're still not unlike

357
00:14:56,740 --> 00:14:53,710
shows that a hundred percent of the

358
00:14:59,620 --> 00:14:56,750
experiences they have our neural related

359
00:15:03,450 --> 00:14:59,630
they're related to the brain now maybe

360
00:15:04,660 --> 00:15:03,460
you want to argue that at some point the

361
00:15:07,030 --> 00:15:04,670
consciousness

362
00:15:08,790 --> 00:15:07,040
lifts off the neurons and floats out

363
00:15:11,710 --> 00:15:08,800

into space is that what you're arguing

364

00:15:13,990 --> 00:15:11,720

I'm arguing that I'm just gonna repeat

365

00:15:15,880 --> 00:15:14,000

to you what dr. long told me don't

366

00:15:17,740 --> 00:15:15,890

repeat to me what dr. lund says well

367

00:15:20,740 --> 00:15:17,750

tell me what you think do you think that

368

00:15:24,340 --> 00:15:20,750

the connectome or your memories or your

369

00:15:26,620 --> 00:15:24,350

thoughts flows off of the brain they're

370

00:15:28,720 --> 00:15:26,630

no longer connected to the neural tissue

371

00:15:30,670 --> 00:15:28,730

and go somewhere else is that what you

372

00:15:31,960 --> 00:15:30,680

think I'm happy to answer that you can

373

00:15:33,070 --> 00:15:31,970

grill me with all the questions but I

374

00:15:33,870 --> 00:15:33,080

didn't want to return to one thing

375

00:15:35,790 --> 00:15:33,880

because I think

376

00:15:39,330 --> 00:15:35,800

come on Alex we're having a cover sit

377

00:15:40,920 --> 00:15:39,340

tell me what you think happened I mean

378

00:15:42,630 --> 00:15:40,930

let me close that window here we're

379

00:15:46,050 --> 00:15:42,640

getting me that's a great San Francisco

380

00:15:47,370 --> 00:15:46,060

sound we got to have that in there yes

381

00:15:49,410 --> 00:15:47,380

so what do you think what do you think

382

00:15:51,510 --> 00:15:49,420

happens I know you want to talked about

383

00:15:54,030 --> 00:15:51,520

red herring I think that's a red herring

384

00:15:57,960 --> 00:15:54,040

because again you're a science guy you

385

00:15:59,900 --> 00:15:57,970

know what so we can falsify paradigms we

386

00:16:03,270 --> 00:15:59,910

can falsify theories without

387

00:16:06,540 --> 00:16:03,280

substituting another theory so I'm not

388

00:16:08,940 --> 00:16:06,550

sure how consciousness works what I

389

00:16:11,940 --> 00:16:08,950

think the evidence strongly points to is

390

00:16:15,360 --> 00:16:11,950

that our current model of consciousness

391

00:16:18,300 --> 00:16:15,370

being 100% tied to neural activity

392

00:16:20,460 --> 00:16:18,310

doesn't fit and that's where I'd return

393

00:16:22,350 --> 00:16:20,470

you to dr. Long's statement because I

394

00:16:24,980 --> 00:16:22,360

think there's some subtle points in

395

00:16:27,270 --> 00:16:24,990

there that folks who are hell-bent on

396

00:16:29,190 --> 00:16:27,280

dismissing near-death experience data

397

00:16:33,060 --> 00:16:29,200

miss so do you remember the point where

398

00:16:35,370 --> 00:16:33,070

he says that not only are these people

399

00:16:38,310 --> 00:16:35,380

having this experience under general

400

00:16:40,920 --> 00:16:38,320

anesthesia but their experience is

401
00:16:43,400 --> 00:16:40,930
consistent with other people that are

402
00:16:46,470 --> 00:16:43,410
having it under different medical

403
00:16:48,810 --> 00:16:46,480
situations structured the same way with

404
00:16:50,070 --> 00:16:48,820
the same neural chemistry but Michael

405
00:16:52,380 --> 00:16:50,080
let me just finish let me just finish my

406
00:16:54,900 --> 00:16:52,390
point because you're really not you're

407
00:16:57,650 --> 00:16:54,910
really not I just you're just not quite

408
00:16:59,850 --> 00:16:57,660
correct there because what we know from

409
00:17:02,400 --> 00:16:59,860
neuroscience what neuroscientist tells

410
00:17:04,460 --> 00:17:02,410
us it's the basics is that different

411
00:17:06,660 --> 00:17:04,470
medical conditions different

412
00:17:08,370 --> 00:17:06,670
physiological conditions create

413
00:17:11,870 --> 00:17:08,380

different situations in the brain like

414

00:17:15,360 --> 00:17:11,880

you mentioned the similar experiences

415

00:17:17,550 --> 00:17:15,370

but they shouldn't be producing the

416

00:17:19,650 --> 00:17:17,560

people that describe heaven they're

417

00:17:22,530 --> 00:17:19,660

different heavens if they were actually

418

00:17:24,900 --> 00:17:22,540

going to a real place the place should

419

00:17:27,270 --> 00:17:24,910

look the same but that doesn't it varies

420

00:17:34,580 --> 00:17:27,280

considerably so how do you explain that

421

00:17:37,350 --> 00:17:34,590

mr. nan skeptic - not if you've got

422

00:17:39,030 --> 00:17:37,360

actual place it should look to say why

423

00:17:42,360 --> 00:17:39,040

doesn't it look the same you got me on

424

00:17:44,040 --> 00:17:42,370

that I cannot explain that let me see

425

00:17:46,320 --> 00:17:44,050

the same people you know Christians see

426

00:17:48,360 --> 00:17:46,330

Jesus but other words that are not quick

427

00:17:51,009 --> 00:17:48,370

they don't see Jesus

428

00:17:52,629 --> 00:17:51,019

you got me you got me on that too that's

429

00:17:55,210 --> 00:17:52,639

a that's a question I don't have an

430

00:17:59,499 --> 00:17:55,220

answer for it well okay so one answer is

431

00:18:01,779 --> 00:17:59,509

that do you want to I want to I want to

432

00:18:03,999 --> 00:18:01,789

get another researcher to the table

433

00:18:06,909 --> 00:18:04,009

because in your book one of the points

434

00:18:09,039 --> 00:18:06,919

you make is okay transformative power

435

00:18:10,690 --> 00:18:09,049

near-death experiences I'm not denying

436

00:18:12,430 --> 00:18:10,700

that they're transformed but that's not

437

00:18:16,110 --> 00:18:12,440

that's not what her clip says but her

438

00:18:18,159 --> 00:18:16,120

Clips speaks to specifically

439

00:18:21,820 --> 00:18:18,169

specifically this is right out of your

440

00:18:23,980 --> 00:18:21,830

book which it is you make the point that

441

00:18:27,430 --> 00:18:23,990

hey people when they're resuscitated

442

00:18:29,169 --> 00:18:27,440

they claim to have seen things that they

443

00:18:31,330 --> 00:18:29,179

shouldn't be able to see well they've

444

00:18:34,570 --> 00:18:31,340

seen it on TV they make it up here's a

445

00:18:36,820 --> 00:18:34,580

researcher who asked that question with

446

00:18:39,850 --> 00:18:36,830

the control group I had then patients

447

00:18:41,889 --> 00:18:39,860

who'd been successfully resuscitated but

448

00:18:43,539 --> 00:18:41,899

they didn't have a near-death experience

449

00:18:45,940 --> 00:18:43,549

so they didn't have the antibody

450

00:18:48,430 --> 00:18:45,950

component and I asked them if they could

451
00:18:51,879 --> 00:18:48,440
describe what they thought that we had

452
00:18:53,950 --> 00:18:51,889
done to them and they were like what do

453
00:18:59,799 --> 00:18:53,960
you mean I don't I was dead I don't

454
00:19:03,220 --> 00:18:59,809
remember anything right I have no idea

455
00:19:05,320 --> 00:19:03,230
what you did to me at all like and the

456
00:19:07,690 --> 00:19:05,330
majority of them couldn't even guess

457
00:19:10,119 --> 00:19:07,700
they couldn't make a guess as to what

458
00:19:12,999 --> 00:19:10,129
we'd done and then a few of them then

459
00:19:15,249 --> 00:19:13,009
did make a guess and it was based on TV

460
00:19:17,379 --> 00:19:15,259
Hospital dramas that they've been

461
00:19:19,600 --> 00:19:17,389
watching and what I found is that there

462
00:19:21,909 --> 00:19:19,610
were errors and misconceptions in what

463
00:19:24,220 --> 00:19:21,919

they thought we had done to them and so

464

00:19:26,919 --> 00:19:24,230

some of them thought that they had been

465

00:19:28,720 --> 00:19:26,929

DC shocked with the paddles and they

466

00:19:31,869 --> 00:19:28,730

hadn't those people had just had the

467

00:19:34,149 --> 00:19:31,879

resuscitation the CPR and drugs

468

00:19:37,269 --> 00:19:34,159

administered such as adrenaline or

469

00:19:40,570 --> 00:19:37,279

noradrenaline and then some of them made

470

00:19:42,820 --> 00:19:40,580

educated guesses but the police where

471

00:19:45,310 --> 00:19:42,830

they thought that we put the paddles on

472

00:19:49,600 --> 00:19:45,320

to their body was completely erroneous

473

00:19:51,279 --> 00:19:49,610

it was wrong it was incorrect you know

474

00:19:54,909 --> 00:19:51,289

this is great stuff

475

00:19:57,340 --> 00:19:54,919

yeah so it just you know it just goes to

476
00:20:00,159 --> 00:19:57,350
show that the people who did report the

477
00:20:01,450 --> 00:20:00,169
near-death experience described their

478
00:20:03,220 --> 00:20:01,460
experience with

479
00:20:05,800 --> 00:20:03,230
he receiver as the control group would

480
00:20:09,550 --> 00:20:05,810
wince accurate and they most of them

481
00:20:12,430 --> 00:20:09,560
couldn't even hazard a guess okay so

482
00:20:15,910 --> 00:20:12,440
first of all full disclosure you didn't

483
00:20:18,820 --> 00:20:15,920
know about that research I know about

484
00:20:21,430 --> 00:20:18,830
similar research that is that what are

485
00:20:23,560 --> 00:20:21,440
the objective criteria by which they

486
00:20:27,160 --> 00:20:23,570
decide whether a narrative account is a

487
00:20:29,200 --> 00:20:27,170
hit or a miss of what they did how many

488
00:20:31,540 --> 00:20:29,210

details have to get correct for you to

489

00:20:33,700 --> 00:20:31,550

say yes that's accurate for what we were

490

00:20:35,290 --> 00:20:33,710

doing - you know you must have gotten

491

00:20:38,710 --> 00:20:35,300

that from a TV drama because that's not

492

00:20:43,660 --> 00:20:41,170

oh no no this is super in science you

493

00:20:45,850 --> 00:20:43,670

have to operationally slide your back to

494

00:20:49,720 --> 00:20:45,860

science she wrote and published a

495

00:20:51,610 --> 00:20:49,730

peer-reviewed paper what was the

496

00:20:54,460 --> 00:20:51,620

criteria for deciding if a narrative was

497

00:20:56,110 --> 00:20:54,470

a hit well the the narrative was the

498

00:20:58,630 --> 00:20:56,120

survey that they did which was a

499

00:21:00,300 --> 00:20:58,640

professional scientific survey right do

500

00:21:02,410 --> 00:21:00,310

you understand I mean I don't want to

501
00:21:04,360 --> 00:21:02,420
sound condescending of course you

502
00:21:06,910 --> 00:21:04,370
understand that medical surveys are

503
00:21:08,890 --> 00:21:06,920
really the backbone of science so if

504
00:21:10,660 --> 00:21:08,900
someone takes a medication we go in and

505
00:21:11,830 --> 00:21:10,670
we ask him how did you feel you know

506
00:21:13,990 --> 00:21:11,840
it's supposed to help you with the pain

507
00:21:16,000 --> 00:21:14,000
is your pain reduced how does this what

508
00:21:18,520 --> 00:21:16,010
is this sensation so people were calling

509
00:21:21,550 --> 00:21:18,530
experience and calling things are a part

510
00:21:23,800 --> 00:21:21,560
of it so she did of your question if the

511
00:21:27,700 --> 00:21:23,810
person is floating up of the ceiling and

512
00:21:29,500 --> 00:21:27,710
looking down at the operating table or

513
00:21:32,440 --> 00:21:29,510

whatever right and that they're getting

514

00:21:34,330 --> 00:21:32,450

details beyond what somebody would from

515

00:21:35,770 --> 00:21:34,340

their imagination okay you surely know

516

00:21:37,620 --> 00:21:35,780

about the experiment where this has

517

00:21:39,700 --> 00:21:37,630

already been done where they set up

518

00:21:41,800 --> 00:21:39,710

platforms up by the ceiling with

519

00:21:43,750 --> 00:21:41,810

photographs pacing up such that if

520

00:21:45,670 --> 00:21:43,760

somebody does this in an ER you're

521

00:21:49,840 --> 00:21:45,680

referring to dr. Sam Parr Nia who is a

522

00:21:51,040 --> 00:21:49,850

colleague and they've never had any okay

523

00:21:54,130 --> 00:21:51,050

here I not but again you're

524

00:21:56,110 --> 00:21:54,140

misrepresenting that remark but the more

525

00:21:59,160 --> 00:21:56,120

you hone down and fine-tune the

526

00:22:03,070 --> 00:21:59,170

objective exact opposite is true the

527

00:22:05,140 --> 00:22:03,080

opposites just like with ESP as sue

528

00:22:07,840 --> 00:22:05,150

black Murrow would point always pointed

529

00:22:09,610 --> 00:22:07,850

out also with nd ease the tiger you make

530

00:22:12,160 --> 00:22:09,620

the controls the weak or the effect gets

531

00:22:14,080 --> 00:22:12,170

I don't think that's true at all in as a

532

00:22:14,920 --> 00:22:14,090

matter of fact that's kind of my main

533

00:22:17,560 --> 00:22:14,930

point that I'm

534

00:22:20,050 --> 00:22:17,570

comin at you with is I just don't think

535

00:22:22,150 --> 00:22:20,060

you've fairly looked at the near-death

536

00:22:24,220 --> 00:22:22,160

experience research like you just

537

00:22:26,800 --> 00:22:24,230

referenced dr. Sam Vanya been on the

538

00:22:29,140 --> 00:22:26,810

show multiple times dr. penny Sartori

539

00:22:30,580 --> 00:22:29,150

been on the show multiple times skeptics

540

00:22:33,460 --> 00:22:30,590

of near-death experience science

541

00:22:37,690 --> 00:22:33,470

interviewed many of them

542

00:22:41,080 --> 00:22:37,700

Sam porneia and dr. penny Sartori wrong

543

00:22:43,090 --> 00:22:41,090

with dr. Peter fennec were a group that

544

00:22:46,180 --> 00:22:43,100

has researched together they started out

545

00:22:48,210 --> 00:22:46,190

in the UK all this different stuff dr.

546

00:22:52,360 --> 00:22:48,220

Sam Varney is one of the leading experts

547

00:22:56,140 --> 00:22:52,370

on resuscitation so again these are

548

00:22:58,180 --> 00:22:56,150

medical experts their conclusions matter

549

00:23:01,200 --> 00:22:58,190

they matter more than someone just

550

00:23:05,490 --> 00:23:01,210

casually looking at it like our Nia's

551
00:23:09,010 --> 00:23:05,500
conclusion is exactly consistent with

552
00:23:12,390 --> 00:23:09,020
dr. penny Sartori dr. Peter fennec dr.

553
00:23:14,860 --> 00:23:12,400
jeff murray near-death experience

554
00:23:17,920 --> 00:23:14,870
researcher has come to the same

555
00:23:19,620 --> 00:23:17,930
conclusion what they either suggest that

556
00:23:22,990 --> 00:23:19,630
contrary

557
00:23:25,540 --> 00:23:23,000
no one's ever reported seen one of the

558
00:23:27,310 --> 00:23:25,550
photographs accurately never not one so

559
00:23:29,560 --> 00:23:27,320
what are you talking about we can talk

560
00:23:31,600 --> 00:23:29,570
about the conclusions that the guy has

561
00:23:33,250 --> 00:23:31,610
from his research and you have to be

562
00:23:34,810 --> 00:23:33,260
careful with this because as we talked

563
00:23:38,080 --> 00:23:34,820

about before and we can talk about again

564

00:23:40,780 --> 00:23:38,090

you you can't misrepresent someone's

565

00:23:43,030 --> 00:23:40,790

position you can pick apart their

566

00:23:44,800 --> 00:23:43,040

research and say why you think it's

567

00:23:46,210 --> 00:23:44,810

wrong but you can't say they're saying

568

00:23:52,950 --> 00:23:46,220

one thing when they're saying another

569

00:23:56,160 --> 00:23:52,960

that I can't take your book and say oh I

570

00:23:59,990 --> 00:23:56,170

shall give you an example

571

00:24:03,800 --> 00:24:00,000

okay you remember this one right yeah so

572

00:24:06,540 --> 00:24:03,810

dr. PIM van Lommel writes this paper

573

00:24:13,470 --> 00:24:06,550

Michael Shermer Scientific American says

574

00:24:18,090 --> 00:24:13,480

hey this thing strikes a blow against ya

575

00:24:21,750 --> 00:24:18,100

in my opinion no you can't you can't

576

00:24:27,110 --> 00:24:21,760

only the guy when you have when you

577

00:24:34,950 --> 00:24:30,240

saying that he thinks that it supports

578

00:24:36,780 --> 00:24:34,960

the you know the monist position of only

579

00:24:39,450 --> 00:24:36,790

brain and oh my I didn't say that I said

580

00:24:40,950 --> 00:24:39,460

that's my opinion no what you said is

581

00:24:43,830 --> 00:24:40,960

right up on the screen

582

00:24:48,260 --> 00:24:43,840

you read that this study delivers a blow

583

00:24:50,790 --> 00:24:48,270

to the idea that mind every separate

584

00:24:53,160 --> 00:24:50,800

delivers a blow yeah that's right that

585

00:24:55,470 --> 00:24:53,170

would be like me saying your book

586

00:24:59,820 --> 00:24:55,480

heavens and earth that heavens on earth

587

00:25:02,490 --> 00:24:59,830

delivers a blow against the neurological

588

00:25:04,440 --> 00:25:02,500

model that consciousness is typing yeah

589

00:25:06,510 --> 00:25:04,450

no I would be could do that

590

00:25:10,470 --> 00:25:06,520

I could do that I could do that but I

591

00:25:13,140 --> 00:25:10,480

would be misrepresenting its position I

592

00:25:14,100 --> 00:25:13,150

wouldn't be fair to my audience I if I

593

00:25:17,010 --> 00:25:14,110

told my audience

594

00:25:18,690 --> 00:25:17,020

hey Michael Shermer thinks that's not

595

00:25:21,390 --> 00:25:18,700

the case but I think that's the case

596

00:25:23,880 --> 00:25:21,400

that's one thing but to say that his

597

00:25:25,770 --> 00:25:23,890

book without putting into context

598

00:25:27,900 --> 00:25:25,780

delivers appalled and and the evidence

599

00:25:30,090 --> 00:25:27,910

of this is clear I mean you have dr.

600

00:25:33,210 --> 00:25:30,100

Pinto mama'll coming at you saying hey

601
00:25:35,520 --> 00:25:33,220
this is this is completely wrong my

602
00:25:38,550 --> 00:25:35,530
research argues exactly the opposite but

603
00:25:40,770 --> 00:25:38,560
I don't want to argue for that but I

604
00:25:42,900 --> 00:25:40,780
think his research points in the

605
00:25:45,630 --> 00:25:42,910
opposite direction it does not point to

606
00:25:48,150 --> 00:25:45,640
consciousness beyond lies it points to

607
00:25:51,510 --> 00:25:48,160
powerful neurological experiences that

608
00:25:54,180 --> 00:25:51,520
people misrepresent as floating off into

609
00:25:55,920 --> 00:25:54,190
the ether somewhere so let's get at that

610
00:25:57,360 --> 00:25:55,930
lets tell me what you think in your

611
00:25:59,910 --> 00:25:57,370
opinion since you studied this

612
00:26:03,090 --> 00:25:59,920
extensively when the person is up by the

613
00:26:05,940 --> 00:26:03,100

ceiling looking down what is the medium

614

00:26:07,920 --> 00:26:05,950

or platform that olds the thoughts and

615

00:26:09,460 --> 00:26:07,930

memories and and how do you see

616

00:26:11,890 --> 00:26:09,470

something without a with

617

00:26:14,950 --> 00:26:11,900

visual apparatus without afraid how does

618

00:26:17,440 --> 00:26:14,960

an ethereal spirit see anything again

619

00:26:19,990 --> 00:26:17,450

and I repeat myself but I really feel

620

00:26:24,210 --> 00:26:20,000

strongly about this is that I don't

621

00:26:27,190 --> 00:26:24,220

think we have to to falsify the existing

622

00:26:29,830 --> 00:26:27,200

model of mind equals brain and we should

623

00:26:32,470 --> 00:26:29,840

never look beyond that is a huge step

624

00:26:34,299 --> 00:26:32,480

and to take that step allows us to then

625

00:26:35,830 --> 00:26:34,309

begin to answer those questions I don't

626

00:26:37,899 --> 00:26:35,840

think we have to have those questions

627

00:26:40,000 --> 00:26:37,909

answered in order to say this is what

628

00:26:44,080 --> 00:26:40,010

the data is telling us this is what the

629

00:26:46,470 --> 00:26:44,090

scientists are telling us it's clear

630

00:26:49,270 --> 00:26:46,480

from this conversation and the books and

631

00:26:51,820 --> 00:26:49,280

papers you're showing me that you and

632

00:26:54,520 --> 00:26:51,830

these other researchers definitely think

633

00:26:56,890 --> 00:26:54,530

this is evidence of the continuation of

634

00:26:57,730 --> 00:26:56,900

consciousness all right so curious minds

635

00:26:59,500 --> 00:26:57,740

want to know

636

00:27:04,270 --> 00:26:59,510

how does consciousness continue without

637

00:27:06,250 --> 00:27:04,280

a brain but again that's the question

638

00:27:09,039 --> 00:27:06,260

that's the question we need a man on the

639

00:27:13,090 --> 00:27:09,049

moon effort to answer but you know the

640

00:27:14,830 --> 00:27:13,100

one point that you'd make the nose okay

641

00:27:15,669 --> 00:27:14,840

right that's right no one knows it it's

642

00:27:17,289 --> 00:27:15,679

a mystery

643

00:27:19,659 --> 00:27:17,299

so one thing that isn't in this room

644

00:27:21,789 --> 00:27:19,669

that I think we can't miss repeat go

645

00:27:24,220 --> 00:27:21,799

ahead I'm so mera logical activity or

646

00:27:27,159 --> 00:27:24,230

it's neurological activity and something

647

00:27:30,039 --> 00:27:27,169

else okay so I compiled a lot of

648

00:27:32,620 --> 00:27:30,049

evidence that it and not just with the

649

00:27:34,930 --> 00:27:32,630

nbe say in my chapter with Deepak Chopra

650

00:27:37,090 --> 00:27:34,940

he thinks consciousness continues beyond

651
00:27:39,310 --> 00:27:37,100
death not because it floats off the

652
00:27:41,799 --> 00:27:39,320
brain and is hovering somewhere else but

653
00:27:44,560 --> 00:27:41,809
because consciousness is well I'll use

654
00:27:46,690 --> 00:27:44,570
his words the the ontological primitive

655
00:27:48,520 --> 00:27:46,700
it is the ground of all being you can't

656
00:27:51,100 --> 00:27:48,530
get underneath consciousness you can't

657
00:27:54,100 --> 00:27:51,110
drill into the atom down to strings or

658
00:27:56,740 --> 00:27:54,110
quarks and find consciousness it is in a

659
00:28:00,880 --> 00:27:56,750
sort of pan psychism way it's everywhere

660
00:28:04,060 --> 00:28:00,890
and so when your conscious mind lifts

661
00:28:05,830 --> 00:28:04,070
off the the brain it doesn't go anywhere

662
00:28:07,240 --> 00:28:05,840
it's just it's just still part of

663
00:28:09,399 --> 00:28:07,250

consciousness that's pervasive

664

00:28:11,440 --> 00:28:09,409

throughout the universe so it's the same

665

00:28:13,600 --> 00:28:11,450

question with epochs that I say to him

666

00:28:15,820 --> 00:28:13,610

well what's more likely that the

667

00:28:18,730 --> 00:28:15,830

research we have in Neurology points to

668

00:28:21,159 --> 00:28:18,740

the brain the mind equals the brain and

669

00:28:22,960 --> 00:28:21,169

nothing more or the mind equals the

670

00:28:25,480 --> 00:28:22,970

brain and something more and

671

00:28:28,060 --> 00:28:25,490

my opinion it the evidence points to

672

00:28:30,100 --> 00:28:28,070

just brain in his opinion if there's

673

00:28:32,320 --> 00:28:30,110

enough to go in the other direction okay

674

00:28:34,120 --> 00:28:32,330

so we don't have a part of the problem

675

00:28:35,289 --> 00:28:34,130

you and I and everybody else has is we

676

00:28:38,860 --> 00:28:35,299

don't have a cogent theory of

677

00:28:40,659 --> 00:28:38,870

consciousness we don't know how brains

678

00:28:43,419 --> 00:28:40,669

produce what we're doing right now that

679

00:28:45,940 --> 00:28:43,429

is experiencing life and so without that

680

00:28:48,010 --> 00:28:45,950

theory of consciousness we're not going

681

00:28:49,990 --> 00:28:48,020

to have a cogent theory of altered

682

00:28:52,330 --> 00:28:50,000

states of consciousness so we have a

683

00:28:54,220 --> 00:28:52,340

collection of of accounts and

684

00:28:55,750 --> 00:28:54,230

experiments of unusual things that

685

00:28:58,990 --> 00:28:55,760

happen not just endings

686

00:29:00,490 --> 00:28:59,000

there's there's many many more unusual I

687

00:29:02,049 --> 00:29:00,500

have a whole chapter on anomalous

688

00:29:05,020 --> 00:29:02,059

psychological experiences that people

689

00:29:07,060 --> 00:29:05,030

have including my own and you know I've

690

00:29:09,159 --> 00:29:07,070

written about you know the sense

691

00:29:12,220 --> 00:29:09,169

presence that people have Alpine

692

00:29:13,930 --> 00:29:12,230

climbers and solo sailors and solo

693

00:29:15,789 --> 00:29:13,940

fliers and so on with a sense of

694

00:29:17,620 --> 00:29:15,799

presence in the room very powerful

695

00:29:19,330 --> 00:29:17,630

okay there's whole books on anomalous

696

00:29:21,760 --> 00:29:19,340

psychological experiences like Stanley

697

00:29:23,350 --> 00:29:21,770

Creek their studies I know about this

698

00:29:25,000 --> 00:29:23,360

research the question is what does it

699

00:29:26,200 --> 00:29:25,010

represent well we don't know for sure

700

00:29:28,450 --> 00:29:26,210

because we don't understand

701

00:29:30,039 --> 00:29:28,460

consciousness yet so all we can do at

702

00:29:34,029 --> 00:29:30,049

this point and say well in my opinion

703

00:29:36,399 --> 00:29:34,039

the lines of evidence all point to no

704

00:29:38,289 --> 00:29:36,409

brain no mind but there's enough

705

00:29:39,940 --> 00:29:38,299

anomalous weird things and we don't have

706

00:29:41,680 --> 00:29:39,950

a good theory of consciousness that it

707

00:29:43,390 --> 00:29:41,690

allows you and others say well no I

708

00:29:45,310 --> 00:29:43,400

think I'm going to I think I'm going to

709

00:29:47,620 --> 00:29:45,320

say it can go this other way and that

710

00:29:50,350 --> 00:29:47,630

consciousness survives death okay maybe

711

00:29:52,659 --> 00:29:50,360

on that last part I don't know that

712

00:29:53,770 --> 00:29:52,669

that's really the direction where things

713

00:29:55,930 --> 00:29:53,780

are going you know the last time we

714

00:29:58,770 --> 00:29:55,940

talked to you a couple years ago one of

715

00:30:02,470 --> 00:29:58,780

the guys you brought up on your team was

716

00:30:04,960 --> 00:30:02,480

dr. Krystof coke right I got I've spoken

717

00:30:08,159 --> 00:30:04,970

to interviewed on this show hey man he's

718

00:30:11,380 --> 00:30:08,169

moved over he switched nurse alright not

719

00:30:13,299 --> 00:30:11,390

inside okay sort of moved over the

720

00:30:15,039 --> 00:30:13,309

position it has shifted these guys are

721

00:30:16,899 --> 00:30:15,049

no longer holding to the mind equals

722

00:30:18,010 --> 00:30:16,909

brain thing you know another clip I was

723

00:30:20,260 --> 00:30:18,020

going to play for you better put them

724

00:30:22,360 --> 00:30:20,270

about it's very nice to do it but if in

725

00:30:25,570 --> 00:30:22,370

Deepak says you need a brain well hold

726

00:30:27,730 --> 00:30:25,580

on Sam I could play for you the clip of

727

00:30:29,440 --> 00:30:27,740

Sam Harris and David Chalmers right so

728

00:30:31,270 --> 00:30:29,450

Sam Harris I don't think much of Sam

729

00:30:32,889 --> 00:30:31,280

Harris but he's a name everybody knows

730

00:30:35,470 --> 00:30:32,899

David Chalmers one of the leading

731

00:30:36,910 --> 00:30:35,480

researchers in consciousness for a

732

00:30:40,570 --> 00:30:36,920

number of years and there

733

00:30:42,520 --> 00:30:40,580

are talking they say you know Dan

734

00:30:44,260 --> 00:30:42,530

Dennett you know the consciousness is an

735

00:30:46,990 --> 00:30:44,270

illusion come on you don't really think

736

00:30:49,510 --> 00:30:47,000

he believes that do you I mean we're not

737

00:30:51,730 --> 00:30:49,520

still stuck there right so this idea

738

00:30:54,490 --> 00:30:51,740

that you're putting for us this kind of

739

00:30:56,800 --> 00:30:54,500

militant materialism mind equals brain

740

00:30:59,440 --> 00:30:56,810

we've moved past that all the bleeding

741

00:31:03,070 --> 00:30:59,450

players have moved past that Michael

742

00:31:05,590 --> 00:31:03,080

that's just off coke admit has moved

743

00:31:07,810 --> 00:31:05,600

past it David Chalmers has moved past it

744

00:31:11,710 --> 00:31:07,820

Sam has has moved past it who are you

745

00:31:14,380 --> 00:31:11,720

gonna point to I know I know Sam quite

746

00:31:16,510 --> 00:31:14,390

well he hasn't moved past anything what

747

00:31:18,670 --> 00:31:16,520

are you talking about he's he's not a

748

00:31:22,630 --> 00:31:18,680

strict materialist he's not a strict

749

00:31:25,900 --> 00:31:22,640

mind equals brain guy no he's totally in

750

00:31:28,870 --> 00:31:25,910

the pan psychism spirituality something

751

00:31:31,090 --> 00:31:28,880

other than strict mind hell's brain

752

00:31:33,580 --> 00:31:31,100

materialism did a public event together

753

00:31:35,350 --> 00:31:33,590

in Austin that he's been opposed in a

754

00:31:38,650 --> 00:31:35,360

week or two that you can listen to where

755

00:31:40,150 --> 00:31:38,660

you know he you know we asked them bring

756

00:31:41,740 --> 00:31:40,160

him on I'll have both you guys on at the

757

00:31:44,790 --> 00:31:41,750

same time and I'll invite the people

758

00:31:46,510 --> 00:31:44,800

that got be it but anyway all right so

759

00:31:49,360 --> 00:31:46,520

obviously we're gonna have to agree to

760

00:31:51,730 --> 00:31:49,370

disagree on this point and it's not

761

00:31:54,610 --> 00:31:51,740

gonna be resolved you know today you

762

00:31:56,050 --> 00:31:54,620

know it's a hard problem and you know

763

00:31:58,090 --> 00:31:56,060

that's why Chalmers calls it the heart

764

00:32:01,200 --> 00:31:58,100

problem I'm not sure I've talked to

765

00:32:04,450 --> 00:32:01,210

Peter about this who's a good friend it

766

00:32:07,060 --> 00:32:04,460

Steve thinks it may not be a soluble

767

00:32:10,420 --> 00:32:07,070

problem because what we're phrasing it

768

00:32:12,820 --> 00:32:10,430

the wrong way we're asking science to do

769

00:32:14,350 --> 00:32:12,830

something they can't do in terms of you

770

00:32:16,480 --> 00:32:14,360

know what first of all what do you even

771

00:32:18,640 --> 00:32:16,490

mean by consciousness now like what Sam

772

00:32:21,040 --> 00:32:18,650

means I think in most people would agree

773

00:32:23,140 --> 00:32:21,050

is what is like to be something like

774

00:32:25,180 --> 00:32:23,150

what it's like to be a bat or what it's

775

00:32:27,250 --> 00:32:25,190

like to be a dolphin now on stage we

776

00:32:30,340 --> 00:32:27,260

kind of disagreed on on the next point

777

00:32:32,440 --> 00:32:30,350

which is in my opinion if to find out

778

00:32:34,660 --> 00:32:32,450

what it's like to be a dolphin say you

779

00:32:37,630 --> 00:32:34,670

know I strapped on flippers and I put on

780

00:32:41,590 --> 00:32:37,640

some sonar equipment and I reprogram my

781

00:32:44,710 --> 00:32:41,600

brain to process sonar instead of visual

782

00:32:47,290 --> 00:32:44,720

and whatever instead of human apparatus

783

00:32:50,410 --> 00:32:47,300

and I just kept morphine a lot and hold

784

00:32:52,510 --> 00:32:50,420

my breath for 10 minutes and it's

785

00:32:54,910 --> 00:32:52,520

and so on at some point I would just be

786

00:32:56,470 --> 00:32:54,920

a dolphin and I wouldn't even be I

787

00:32:58,390 --> 00:32:56,480

wouldn't even know that I was a human

788

00:33:00,550 --> 00:32:58,400

asking what it's like to be a dolphin

789

00:33:01,960 --> 00:33:00,560

now Sam disagrees with that so I'm not

790

00:33:03,760 --> 00:33:01,970

sure actually what that means in terms

791

00:33:06,280 --> 00:33:03,770

of your pants I don't think it's that

792

00:33:10,060 --> 00:33:06,290

but but that what it's like to be

793

00:33:12,280 --> 00:33:10,070

something to get at that you have to

794

00:33:13,780 --> 00:33:12,290

kind of be that you know what it's like

795

00:33:16,000 --> 00:33:13,790

to be a glass of water you know deep

796

00:33:17,830 --> 00:33:16,010

inside is no but the glass of water is

797

00:33:20,020 --> 00:33:17,840

is conscious it's just very simple

798

00:33:21,550 --> 00:33:20,030

consciousness and you know what it's

799

00:33:24,520 --> 00:33:21,560

like to be a dog I can kind of envision

800

00:33:26,790 --> 00:33:24,530

what it's like to be a dog but it's hard

801
00:33:30,520 --> 00:33:26,800
to do because I'm so trapped in my own

802
00:33:33,160 --> 00:33:30,530
human brain all right so you know we

803
00:33:34,780 --> 00:33:33,170
focused a lot on this extended

804
00:33:38,020 --> 00:33:34,790
consciousness and consciousness thing

805
00:33:40,150 --> 00:33:38,030
what are some of the other key findings

806
00:33:42,430 --> 00:33:40,160
or points that you were trying to get

807
00:33:45,850 --> 00:33:42,440
across in the book heavens on earth

808
00:33:47,890 --> 00:33:45,860
because you you do have its we did focus

809
00:33:49,240 --> 00:33:47,900
on a small part of it what else do

810
00:33:50,500 --> 00:33:49,250
people need to know like even even at

811
00:33:52,300 --> 00:33:50,510
the very beginning I kind of pulled you

812
00:33:54,220 --> 00:33:52,310
off this thing of the history of heaven

813
00:33:56,920 --> 00:33:54,230

which i think is an interesting point

814

00:33:58,660 --> 00:33:56,930

well from the very beginning we can't

815

00:34:00,820 --> 00:33:58,670

even imagine what it's like to be dead

816

00:34:03,340 --> 00:34:00,830

because to imagine something you have to

817

00:34:05,920 --> 00:34:03,350

be alive in conscious so it's like

818

00:34:08,590 --> 00:34:05,930

imagine being under general anesthesia

819

00:34:10,899 --> 00:34:08,600

you can't imagine because imagine

820

00:34:12,930 --> 00:34:10,909

something you have to be awake alright

821

00:34:15,700 --> 00:34:12,940

so unless you have this condition where

822

00:34:17,800 --> 00:34:15,710

you wake up at under anesthesia and

823

00:34:19,120 --> 00:34:17,810

you're aware but you can't move and it's

824

00:34:21,430 --> 00:34:19,130

terrifying and all that but I'm not

825

00:34:23,860 --> 00:34:21,440

talking about that all's it is is you

826
00:34:25,300 --> 00:34:23,870
know boom boom lights out and then you

827
00:34:26,950 --> 00:34:25,310
wake up and you have no sense of how

828
00:34:29,260 --> 00:34:26,960
much time is gone and so on it's just

829
00:34:31,750 --> 00:34:29,270
yeah you can't we don't have the words

830
00:34:34,240 --> 00:34:31,760
describe it darkness nothing emptiness

831
00:34:35,919 --> 00:34:34,250
and so you know to ask them well where

832
00:34:39,130 --> 00:34:35,929
do you go and at the you know after

833
00:34:41,139 --> 00:34:39,140
death in you know the same place you

834
00:34:41,740 --> 00:34:41,149
were before you were born you just don't

835
00:34:43,690 --> 00:34:41,750
exist

836
00:34:45,360 --> 00:34:43,700
well I can't conceive of what that would

837
00:34:47,980 --> 00:34:45,370
be like it's it's literally

838
00:34:50,500 --> 00:34:47,990

inconceivable so this sets up something

839

00:34:52,780 --> 00:34:50,510

of a paradox I cannot conceive of not

840

00:34:55,000 --> 00:34:52,790

being alive and yet I see death all

841

00:34:57,070 --> 00:34:55,010

around and the hundred billion people

842

00:34:59,680 --> 00:34:57,080

that lived and died before us are gone

843

00:35:01,390 --> 00:34:59,690

and they've never come back short of the

844

00:35:03,670 --> 00:35:01,400

handful of near-death experience that

845

00:35:04,000 --> 00:35:03,680

things are the claims of resurrection of

846

00:35:08,290 --> 00:35:04,010

Jesus

847

00:35:11,140 --> 00:35:08,300

things like that or in the case of you

848

00:35:12,880 --> 00:35:11,150

know Hinduism reincarnation okay so I

849

00:35:16,090 --> 00:35:12,890

mean you're focused on nve's but there's

850

00:35:17,710 --> 00:35:16,100

lots of other versions of this that have

851

00:35:19,150 --> 00:35:17,720

nothing to do with that and and the

852

00:35:21,400 --> 00:35:19,160

people believe the strongly as you do

853

00:35:25,930 --> 00:35:21,410

you know that something continues after

854

00:35:28,420 --> 00:35:25,940

conscious okay in my book I conclude

855

00:35:30,070 --> 00:35:28,430

that no one knows including me I don't

856

00:35:32,410 --> 00:35:30,080

know that there's no afterlife I don't

857

00:35:34,750 --> 00:35:32,420

know that you know when I close my eyes

858

00:35:37,420 --> 00:35:34,760

for the final time I won't wake up in

859

00:35:39,310 --> 00:35:37,430

some place and there's my friends Carl

860

00:35:42,370 --> 00:35:39,320

Sagan and Christopher Hitchens and

861

00:35:44,050 --> 00:35:42,380

Stephen Jay Gould and my parents and you

862

00:35:45,970 --> 00:35:44,060

know people that I have known and loved

863

00:35:47,560 --> 00:35:45,980

and are gone maybe they're gonna be

864

00:35:49,300 --> 00:35:47,570

somewhere and I'm gonna be there with

865

00:35:52,630 --> 00:35:49,310

them I'm good with that

866

00:35:54,460 --> 00:35:52,640

I think I find him quoting Christopher

867

00:35:56,620 --> 00:35:54,470

Hitchens description of the Christian

868

00:35:58,480 --> 00:35:56,630

heaven and celestial North Korea you

869

00:36:00,310 --> 00:35:58,490

know we you have this dictator that

870

00:36:01,660 --> 00:36:00,320

knows all your thoughts and controls

871

00:36:03,850 --> 00:36:01,670

everything and you're there to worship

872

00:36:05,950 --> 00:36:03,860

you know the dear leader that doesn't

873

00:36:08,680 --> 00:36:05,960

sound very heavenly to me but you know

874

00:36:09,820 --> 00:36:08,690

his point is that what are we talking

875

00:36:12,250 --> 00:36:09,830

about when we're talking about the

876

00:36:14,680 --> 00:36:12,260

continuation off into someplace else so

877

00:36:16,540 --> 00:36:14,690

this is not a light problem you know

878

00:36:19,840 --> 00:36:16,550

with Christian groups for example I said

879

00:36:21,340 --> 00:36:19,850

well when I'm when I die and I'm reborn

880

00:36:24,100 --> 00:36:21,350

I mean I'm a Christian so I'm in heaven

881

00:36:26,500 --> 00:36:24,110

with Jesus what's up there is it this

882

00:36:28,480 --> 00:36:26,510

physical body and some of them go yeah

883

00:36:31,600 --> 00:36:28,490

yeah yeah like Jesus was physically

884

00:36:34,270 --> 00:36:31,610

resurrected the empty tomb the tomb is

885

00:36:36,160 --> 00:36:34,280

empty so his body is not just like it

886

00:36:38,230 --> 00:36:36,170

with your examples of NDE

887

00:36:40,120 --> 00:36:38,240

consciousness lifts off the brain and

888

00:36:42,730 --> 00:36:40,130

floats off somewhere no for Christians

889

00:36:45,430 --> 00:36:42,740

Jesus you know left the tomb the empty

890

00:36:47,590 --> 00:36:45,440

tomb so the physical resurrection of the

891

00:36:52,510 --> 00:36:47,600

whole body and brain is what goes

892

00:36:54,580 --> 00:36:52,520

together for some sex now to that I say

893

00:36:56,260 --> 00:36:54,590

well how old am I then

894

00:36:58,180 --> 00:36:56,270

well you're 30 because that's the age

895

00:37:00,670 --> 00:36:58,190

Jesus was when he was crucified he was

896

00:37:03,520 --> 00:37:00,680

thirty that's like well I'm 63 now so

897

00:37:05,170 --> 00:37:03,530

what happened to the 33 years look you

898

00:37:07,090 --> 00:37:05,180

know that doesn't that go with it you

899

00:37:10,210 --> 00:37:07,100

know all the memories and the stars and

900

00:37:11,380 --> 00:37:10,220

whatever else has happened to be and

901
00:37:13,270 --> 00:37:11,390
they think well no you'll be made whole

902
00:37:15,670 --> 00:37:13,280
again you know the blind shall see the

903
00:37:16,900 --> 00:37:15,680
Deaf show ear and the you know

904
00:37:17,829 --> 00:37:16,910
handicapped or whatever will be made

905
00:37:19,900 --> 00:37:17,839
whole again

906
00:37:21,849 --> 00:37:19,910
and so here I quote my friend Julia

907
00:37:23,910 --> 00:37:21,859
Sweeney did Saturday Night Live's media

908
00:37:26,829 --> 00:37:23,920
and her monologue letting go of God

909
00:37:28,569 --> 00:37:26,839
where the Mormon boys come to her house

910
00:37:30,549 --> 00:37:28,579
in Hollywood and knock on the door and

911
00:37:32,289 --> 00:37:30,559
there pitching their Mormon religion you

912
00:37:34,900 --> 00:37:32,299
know everybody gets a planet and so on

913
00:37:36,759 --> 00:37:34,910

and in the you know the blind shall see

914

00:37:38,620 --> 00:37:36,769

in the Deaf shelter yourself because

915

00:37:40,029 --> 00:37:38,630

well I had uterine cancer so I don't

916

00:37:42,279 --> 00:37:40,039

have my uterus anymore do I get my

917

00:37:43,959 --> 00:37:42,289

uterus back when I go to heaven if you

918

00:37:46,120 --> 00:37:43,969

can imagine these 18 year old boys there

919

00:37:48,309 --> 00:37:46,130

starts white shirts guards uterus I

920

00:37:50,160 --> 00:37:48,319

don't know yeah you get your uterus

921

00:37:52,539 --> 00:37:50,170

patch because I don't want it back

922

00:37:56,890 --> 00:37:52,549

because what if you had a nose job and

923

00:37:59,380 --> 00:37:56,900

you like no I mean so there's all kinds

924

00:38:01,059 --> 00:37:59,390

of logistical issues here what are we

925

00:38:03,039 --> 00:38:01,069

talking about when you're up there okay

926

00:38:04,779 --> 00:38:03,049

maybe it's not the physical but it's

927

00:38:07,390 --> 00:38:04,789

just your memories okay but which

928

00:38:10,420 --> 00:38:07,400

memories because there's no such thing

929

00:38:11,829 --> 00:38:10,430

as a fix you your memories change

930

00:38:14,319 --> 00:38:11,839

throughout your life they're like a wiki

931

00:38:16,269 --> 00:38:14,329

they're edited constantly and they're

932

00:38:18,130 --> 00:38:16,279

upgraded and changed depending on new

933

00:38:20,400 --> 00:38:18,140

circumstances we know that we were

934

00:38:23,769 --> 00:38:20,410

biased and we back engineer into our

935

00:38:26,469 --> 00:38:23,779

memories the consequences of what we did

936

00:38:29,049 --> 00:38:26,479

so we justify and rewrite our memories

937

00:38:30,519 --> 00:38:29,059

to justify our actions and so on so all

938

00:38:33,609 --> 00:38:30,529

this happens in the course of a lifetime

939

00:38:35,499 --> 00:38:33,619

there's no like if we took a snapshot of

940

00:38:37,749 --> 00:38:35,509

your connectome as it's called the

941

00:38:39,519 --> 00:38:37,759

analog of your genome and copied it and

942

00:38:41,950 --> 00:38:39,529

put it in the clouds it's the scientific

943

00:38:43,630 --> 00:38:41,960

version of what we're talking about here

944

00:38:45,279 --> 00:38:43,640

that I write about I call it the

945

00:38:46,930 --> 00:38:45,289

afterlife or atheist because this is

946

00:38:48,999 --> 00:38:46,940

what a lot of people are trying to do

947

00:38:50,650 --> 00:38:49,009

copy the connectome which would

948

00:38:53,109 --> 00:38:50,660

presumably be all your memories and

949

00:38:54,789 --> 00:38:53,119

float it off and to store it in a

950

00:38:57,880 --> 00:38:54,799

computer or put it in the cloud or

951
00:38:59,289 --> 00:38:57,890
something to turn it on so first of all

952
00:39:01,089 --> 00:38:59,299
which memories cuz that's just a

953
00:39:03,370 --> 00:39:01,099
snapshot of me at that particular moment

954
00:39:05,620 --> 00:39:03,380
and then if it continues those memories

955
00:39:07,900 --> 00:39:05,630
are going to keep changing but but worse

956
00:39:09,339 --> 00:39:07,910
is the point of view self the point of

957
00:39:11,859 --> 00:39:09,349
view of me looking out through the world

958
00:39:14,799 --> 00:39:11,869
and experiencing life now with there's a

959
00:39:16,630 --> 00:39:14,809
continuation from day to day interrupted

960
00:39:20,049 --> 00:39:16,640
by sleep and anesthesia or whatever but

961
00:39:22,989 --> 00:39:20,059
but there's a continuation to turn it

962
00:39:26,349 --> 00:39:22,999
off and copy it turn it off kill me and

963
00:39:28,150 --> 00:39:26,359

then put the copy into the cloud I don't

964

00:39:31,660 --> 00:39:28,160

think my point of view self would go

965

00:39:33,309 --> 00:39:31,670

with it any more than if we say copy

966

00:39:35,530 --> 00:39:33,319

you Alex right now with the

967

00:39:38,079 --> 00:39:35,540

sophisticated fMRI brain scanner copied

968

00:39:40,030 --> 00:39:38,089

your connectome and uploaded the digital

969

00:39:41,470 --> 00:39:40,040

file of all your memories into the cloud

970

00:39:43,960 --> 00:39:41,480

while you're still alive and you're

971

00:39:46,900 --> 00:39:43,970

still sitting there in your podcast room

972

00:39:50,260 --> 00:39:46,910

they're alive and awake and fine and we

973

00:39:51,789 --> 00:39:50,270

turn the copy on up in the cloud your

974

00:39:53,440 --> 00:39:51,799

point of view self wouldn't suddenly

975

00:39:56,589 --> 00:39:53,450

leap there you'd be still sitting there

976

00:39:59,289 --> 00:39:56,599

going no no this is me Alex that is the

977

00:40:01,599 --> 00:39:59,299

copy now the copy is not you is a copy

978

00:40:03,160 --> 00:40:01,609

now the copy may think it's you when

979

00:40:07,359 --> 00:40:03,170

he's running a podcast or somewhere else

980

00:40:10,510 --> 00:40:07,369

but it's not you okay so all of this is

981

00:40:12,579 --> 00:40:10,520

sort of the deeper philosophical problem

982

00:40:14,770 --> 00:40:12,589

the problem of identity you know who are

983

00:40:16,630 --> 00:40:14,780

you we know for example that our bodies

984

00:40:18,220 --> 00:40:16,640

are recycled every seven to ten years

985

00:40:20,680 --> 00:40:18,230

you're not the same man you were a

986

00:40:24,069 --> 00:40:20,690

decade ago as I'm sure your your friends

987

00:40:27,760 --> 00:40:24,079

tell you okay come on man that's funny

988

00:40:29,500 --> 00:40:27,770

no you're funny you're a good you know

989

00:40:32,410 --> 00:40:29,510

one of the things that when I want to

990

00:40:34,510 --> 00:40:32,420

talk to people about Michael Shermer and

991

00:40:35,890 --> 00:40:34,520

I talk to people are kind of on the

992

00:40:38,200 --> 00:40:35,900

other side of the camp the friend of me

993

00:40:40,750 --> 00:40:38,210

kind of camp you know everybody likes

994

00:40:43,089 --> 00:40:40,760

you you're just you're just a good guy

995

00:40:44,770 --> 00:40:43,099

or you've got to talk to your the other

996

00:40:46,930 --> 00:40:44,780

thing is you're a very open guy you know

997

00:40:48,220 --> 00:40:46,940

not a lot of people do these interviews

998

00:40:50,980 --> 00:40:48,230

you probably forgot what the show is

999

00:40:52,539 --> 00:40:50,990

about which is okay too but you know you

1000

00:40:55,450 --> 00:40:52,549

are an open guy you are a guy who's

1001
00:40:58,569 --> 00:40:55,460
willing to get on stage with Deepak

1002
00:41:00,970 --> 00:40:58,579
Chopra or whoever it is and hash these

1003
00:41:02,410 --> 00:41:00,980
ideas out and I think that's why what I

1004
00:41:05,950 --> 00:41:02,420
was alluding to at the beginning is that

1005
00:41:08,559 --> 00:41:05,960
I haven't seen anyone else do it quite

1006
00:41:09,789 --> 00:41:08,569
like Shermer does it and you think

1007
00:41:12,670 --> 00:41:09,799
there's gonna be other people are gonna

1008
00:41:15,039 --> 00:41:12,680
step in there and do it but I don't see

1009
00:41:18,400 --> 00:41:15,049
him on the horizon so I think it's

1010
00:41:21,640 --> 00:41:18,410
pretty cool I'm not in agreement with

1011
00:41:23,829 --> 00:41:21,650
heavens on earth but I'm sure glad that

1012
00:41:26,260 --> 00:41:23,839
you're out there doing what you do

1013
00:41:29,200 --> 00:41:26,270

you're in San Francisco you're going

1014

00:41:30,940 --> 00:41:29,210

full speed ahead trying to communicate

1015

00:41:32,799 --> 00:41:30,950

these ideas you're on stage talking

1016

00:41:34,240 --> 00:41:32,809

about it what are you doing for this

1017

00:41:38,589 --> 00:41:34,250

book and then what are you doing

1018

00:41:40,690 --> 00:41:38,599

you know what book events but actually

1019

00:41:42,130 --> 00:41:40,700

I'm on stage with Deepak on Tuesday in

1020

00:41:43,750 --> 00:41:42,140

New York City for the intelligence

1021

00:41:45,520 --> 00:41:43,760

squared debate I don't know when you're

1022

00:41:48,820 --> 00:41:45,530

going to air this but if to

1023

00:41:50,950 --> 00:41:48,830

March 27 its livestream people who watch

1024

00:41:54,340 --> 00:41:50,960

it the resolution is the more we have

1025

00:41:55,600 --> 00:41:54,350

all the less we need God okay so he's

1026
00:42:00,550 --> 00:41:55,610
gonna argue I'm not sure what he's doing

1027
00:42:01,510 --> 00:42:00,560
argue but argue a long time blah listen

1028
00:42:04,870 --> 00:42:01,520
to you and I thought you had a great

1029
00:42:06,820 --> 00:42:04,880
point but it was kind of a weary point

1030
00:42:09,910 --> 00:42:06,830
about when you were doing the evolution

1031
00:42:11,830 --> 00:42:09,920
thing with discovery what discover

1032
00:42:13,990 --> 00:42:11,840
against - yeah yeah yeah I said look

1033
00:42:15,490 --> 00:42:14,000
after a while you know I'm gonna go out

1034
00:42:16,510 --> 00:42:15,500
there and I'm gonna wheel out my stuff

1035
00:42:17,890 --> 00:42:16,520
and they're gonna go out there and

1036
00:42:19,570 --> 00:42:17,900
they're gonna wheel out their stuff and

1037
00:42:22,200 --> 00:42:19,580
you know it's kind of predictable not a

1038
00:42:26,140 --> 00:42:22,210

lot but you set it in a way that is like

1039

00:42:28,960 --> 00:42:26,150

truly you know almost like a theatre

1040

00:42:30,460 --> 00:42:28,970

actor a stage actor who has to do it

1041

00:42:32,440 --> 00:42:30,470

still you know I mean that person came

1042

00:42:34,390 --> 00:42:32,450

to see Michael Shermer to see that

1043

00:42:36,430 --> 00:42:34,400

debate to see that played out and that's

1044

00:42:38,260 --> 00:42:36,440

important - so it doesn't demean the

1045

00:42:40,870 --> 00:42:38,270

fact that people might have heard both

1046

00:42:43,090 --> 00:42:40,880

sides of this argument before right yeah

1047

00:42:45,670 --> 00:42:43,100

and so and again I mean we have to have

1048

00:42:47,470 --> 00:42:45,680

some epistemic humility you know we

1049

00:42:50,710 --> 00:42:47,480

don't even know what you don't know and

1050

00:42:52,180 --> 00:42:50,720

there's a lot we don't know then we

1051
00:42:54,520 --> 00:42:52,190
don't even know we don't know about

1052
00:42:56,440 --> 00:42:54,530
things like consciousness so it's

1053
00:42:59,290 --> 00:42:56,450
entirely possible that someone like

1054
00:43:01,360 --> 00:42:59,300
Deepak or yourself or whoever or

1055
00:43:03,790 --> 00:43:01,370
Christians talking about the afterlife

1056
00:43:05,980 --> 00:43:03,800
or or Jews or Muslims you know there's

1057
00:43:08,350 --> 00:43:05,990
lots and lots of different versions of

1058
00:43:11,290 --> 00:43:08,360
this out there that I write about and

1059
00:43:13,630 --> 00:43:11,300
you know you know I guess you know one

1060
00:43:16,090 --> 00:43:13,640
of the one of the appealing things about

1061
00:43:17,590 --> 00:43:16,100
cryonics would be that that you come

1062
00:43:20,680 --> 00:43:17,600
back in a thousand years to see what

1063
00:43:23,140 --> 00:43:20,690

people think then about consciousness

1064

00:43:25,750 --> 00:43:23,150

black holes or you know whatever you

1065

00:43:27,880 --> 00:43:25,760

know the science moves on and you know

1066

00:43:29,230 --> 00:43:27,890

it's just hard to like we're like fish

1067

00:43:31,350 --> 00:43:29,240

in the water you know we don't even know

1068

00:43:34,120 --> 00:43:31,360

that the water is there I don't know

1069

00:43:36,430 --> 00:43:34,130

you know this is why I like Steve

1070

00:43:38,230 --> 00:43:36,440

pingers point about this question of

1071

00:43:40,780 --> 00:43:38,240

consciousness you know the hard problem

1072

00:43:43,390 --> 00:43:40,790

consciousness it maybe that's been

1073

00:43:44,830 --> 00:43:43,400

phrased in a way that we'll never be

1074

00:43:46,690 --> 00:43:44,840

able to answer it the way we're thinking

1075

00:43:48,880 --> 00:43:46,700

about it now we need to think about it

1076
00:43:50,590 --> 00:43:48,890
in some completely different way and

1077
00:43:52,320 --> 00:43:50,600
that may be the case you know there's a

1078
00:43:54,820 --> 00:43:52,330
group of people called the mysterion's

1079
00:43:57,520 --> 00:43:54,830
Martin Gardner was one of these that you

1080
00:43:59,200 --> 00:43:57,530
know there's certain mysteries that it's

1081
00:44:01,780 --> 00:43:59,210
not just that we haven't solved them

1082
00:44:03,790 --> 00:44:01,790
we just have to improve our technologies

1083
00:44:07,750 --> 00:44:03,800
of experiments or whatever is that

1084
00:44:09,490 --> 00:44:07,760
they're insoluble and free like Sam Sam

1085
00:44:11,260 --> 00:44:09,500
Maris and I disagree on freewill he's a

1086
00:44:12,069 --> 00:44:11,270
he's a strict determine Islamic

1087
00:44:14,020 --> 00:44:12,079
compatibilist

1088
00:44:15,940 --> 00:44:14,030

I agree we live in a determined universe

1089

00:44:17,460 --> 00:44:15,950

but that we're part of the causal net

1090

00:44:20,109 --> 00:44:17,470

and we can tweak it and change it

1091

00:44:22,540 --> 00:44:20,119

volitionally but at some point we just

1092

00:44:24,190 --> 00:44:22,550

run into a brick wall of words you know

1093

00:44:27,520 --> 00:44:24,200

what do you mean by determined what do

1094

00:44:30,790 --> 00:44:27,530

you mean by free or volitionalist or

1095

00:44:33,609 --> 00:44:30,800

whatever and like for example I say say

1096

00:44:36,910 --> 00:44:33,619

I said to Sam what's the you know so we

1097

00:44:39,460 --> 00:44:36,920

have a we have a opioid addiction crisis

1098

00:44:41,230 --> 00:44:39,470

in the country now yeah it appears that

1099

00:44:42,970 --> 00:44:41,240

there are some people that really cannot

1100

00:44:45,520 --> 00:44:42,980

control themselves they just go down a

1101

00:44:48,730 --> 00:44:45,530

path and they can't stop and they

1102

00:44:50,859 --> 00:44:48,740

overdose now I don't have this problem I

1103

00:44:52,569 --> 00:44:50,869

know people that are alcoholics my

1104

00:44:54,370 --> 00:44:52,579

father was an alcoholic I can have a

1105

00:44:57,069 --> 00:44:54,380

couple drinks and stop he couldn't I

1106

00:44:58,660 --> 00:44:57,079

know people that cannot stop now

1107

00:44:59,740 --> 00:44:58,670

what's the if we all live in a

1108

00:45:00,910 --> 00:44:59,750

determined universe and we're all

1109

00:45:03,549 --> 00:45:00,920

determined what's the difference doing

1110

00:45:06,039 --> 00:45:03,559

that guy we can't stop and mean can stop

1111

00:45:08,200 --> 00:45:06,049

that he's more determined and I'm less

1112

00:45:09,849 --> 00:45:08,210

determined I mean what you know this is

1113

00:45:12,700 --> 00:45:09,859

my ID and any calls this degrees of

1114

00:45:14,079 --> 00:45:12,710

freedom you know there's certain amounts

1115

00:45:16,510 --> 00:45:14,089

of things you can control or can't

1116

00:45:19,630 --> 00:45:16,520

control depending on a lot of different

1117

00:45:22,420 --> 00:45:19,640

factors so but at some point I told this

1118

00:45:23,740 --> 00:45:22,430

to Sam and Sam says no no no you're

1119

00:45:26,829 --> 00:45:23,750

still determined you're just determined

1120

00:45:28,420 --> 00:45:26,839

in a different way maybe yeah but

1121

00:45:32,049 --> 00:45:28,430

wondering so what do we mean by that

1122

00:45:33,910 --> 00:45:32,059

word determined you know so and what

1123

00:45:35,950 --> 00:45:33,920

kind of this with the point dinkenstein

1124

00:45:38,140 --> 00:45:35,960

made that we're we're restricted by the

1125

00:45:40,480 --> 00:45:38,150

words we use because we have concepts

1126

00:45:43,359 --> 00:45:40,490

the only way for being you to share our

1127

00:45:45,430 --> 00:45:43,369

concepts is to talk and use words and

1128

00:45:46,569 --> 00:45:45,440

the words have certain meanings and

1129

00:45:48,010 --> 00:45:46,579

maybe you mean something slightly

1130

00:45:49,660 --> 00:45:48,020

different than what I mean so we have to

1131

00:45:51,910 --> 00:45:49,670

operationally define the words we're

1132

00:45:55,210 --> 00:45:51,920

using so when we measure it and I look

1133

00:45:56,770 --> 00:45:55,220

at it you point at it then look we're

1134

00:45:59,710 --> 00:45:56,780

talking about the same thing that's not

1135

00:46:02,640 --> 00:45:59,720

always easy to do in science and I think

1136

00:46:05,500 --> 00:46:02,650

consciousness is especially difficult

1137

00:46:08,410 --> 00:46:05,510

problem anyway so that's that's my piece

1138

00:46:10,569 --> 00:46:08,420

there good it's a good piece so again

1139

00:46:12,849 --> 00:46:10,579

folks the name of the book is heavens on

1140

00:46:15,549 --> 00:46:12,859

earth the scientific

1141

00:46:18,009 --> 00:46:15,559

search for the afterlife immortality in

1142

00:46:20,440 --> 00:46:18,019

Utopia our guest has been the one and

1143

00:46:22,710 --> 00:46:20,450

only dr. Michael Shermer thank you so

1144

00:46:24,519 --> 00:46:22,720

much for joining me I really do create

1145

00:46:27,900 --> 00:46:24,529

keep up the good work

1146

00:46:29,920 --> 00:46:27,910

hahahaha but you're the skeptic skeptic

1147

00:46:31,599 --> 00:46:29,930

somebody's got to do it

1148

00:46:32,950 --> 00:46:31,609

hey somebody you know just like the fact

1149

00:46:35,829 --> 00:46:32,960

checker Sammy's got a fact check the

1150

00:46:39,489 --> 00:46:35,839

fact checkers the dr. Seuss who's

1151

00:46:40,329 --> 00:46:39,499

watching the Watchers right okay buddy